

2020

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
Plans Review Subcommittee

**Minutes**

**Thursday, January 9, 2020**

**2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Conference Room, City of Tucson Department of Transportation, Transit Services, 149 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701.**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

Meeting called to order at 1:00 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Jim Sauer (Acting Chair), Michael Becherer, Jill Jenkins, Sharon Chadwick, and Jan Mulder.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Terry Majewski and Helen Erickson.

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, Rick Saldate Jr., and Sol Kohen (PDSD).

**2. Approval of the Legal Action Reports (LARs) from Meeting(s) of 12-05-19 and Revised 12-12-19**

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 to approve the Legal Action Reports from the meetings of 12-05-19 and Revised 12-12-19 as submitted.

**3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

**HPZ 19-112, 741 S. 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue**

**Armory Park Historic Zone, Contributing Resource**

Installation of temporary decorative signage, three (3) on 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and one (1) on 18<sup>th</sup> Street.

*\*At 1:02 PM Commissioner Sauer recused from this case due to his prior professional relationship with the owner of the property.*

*\*\*Commissioner Becherer assumed the role of Acting Chair.*

Staff Taku provided background to the project clarifying the review authority of Armory Park and PRS even though project is now outside the HPZ. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the APHZAB meeting of 12-17-19.

Larry Kappler and Chris Sauer, from BBL 747 LLC, presented the project. Presenters noted that the signs are intended to serve as information, advertisement, and art work to capture the historic character of the neighborhood.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee asked how long the signs will be up. Mr. Kappler stated the signs would be up the entirety of construction, which is tentatively scheduled to be done in February 2021. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Mulder, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 (\*Commissioner Sauer recused and did not vote) to recommend approval as presented, concurring with the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (1) that no more than 1 sign will be in the "H"-zoned portion of the proposed new parcel; (2) that the artwork panels should be separated from the advertising signs (so as to be size compliant); and (3) that TDOT approves that the site locations meet sight visibility requirements.

*\*At 1:11 P.M Commissioner Sauer rejoined the meeting and resumed as Acting Chair for remainder of the meeting.*

**HPZ 19-37, 508 W 18<sup>th</sup> Street**

**Barrio Historico Historic Zone, Contributing Resource**

Revisions to the approved plans, including modifications to the roof line.

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the BHHZAB meetings of 11-18-19 and 12-9-19.

Troy Williams, designer for the applicant Mike Sergovia, presented revised plans based on feedback from the November 18, 2019, meeting. There was confusion as there were multiple undated revisions of drawings, none of which appeared to match the stated intentions of the designer and applicant. Parapets, roof types, and water drainage paths were not clear.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee had same concerns as the BHHZAB on the parapet on the porch, inconsistencies between the plans and presentation; lack of clarity on elevations showing a shed roof; and the Details/Sections that show a parapet on the porch. Applicant agreed to return to PRS with revised drawings. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 (\*Commissioner Sauer rejoined) to continue the review, to allow the applicant to revise the drawings, specifically addressing (1) the north and east elevations of the porch to clearly represent applicant's intent; (2) show proposed configuration of roof in section "A" on sheet 4; (3) show proposed drainage of water as recommended by BHHZAB.

**HPZ 19-78, 524 S Herbert Avenue**

**Armory Park Historic Zone, Contributing Resource**

Rehabilitation of an existing building; new stucco, roof repairs and shingle replacement, fencing and gates; repair and restore windows and doors; new rear addition [**Continued Case, 12-12-19**].

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the request from PRS meeting of 12-12-19 as follows: to document the contributing status of rear addition via construction methods, photo documentation, Sanborn maps, and a site evaluation by the City Historic Preservation Officer.

Dennis Gonzales, property owner presented the project.

Discussion was held. , City of Tucson Historic Preservation Officer Jodie Brown presented her site evaluation findings. The Subcommittee was satisfied with the additional information and documentation presented. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Mulder, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval as presented.

**HPZ 19-94, 505 S Meyer Avenue**

**Barrio Historic Historic Zone, Contributing Resource**

Demolition of a rear addition and construction of a new rear addition [**Continued Case, 12-12-19**].

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the request from PRS meeting of 12-12-19 as follows: (1) allow the applicant to document the contributing status of the rear addition based on construction methods, photo documentation, Sanborn maps, and evaluation by the City Historic Preservation Officer; (2) revise drawings to reflect the proposed step back of twelve (12") to fifteen (15") inches at the addition; and (3) that the water heater and mechanical equipment be screened from public view.

Luke Kippert, homeowner, presented the project.

Discussion was held. City Historic Preservation Officer, Jodie Brown discussed her findings from historic sources and her determination that the proposed work had no adverse impact. The Subcommittee was satisfied with this additional information. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, and duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval of the project as presented.

**HPZ 19-110, 434 East University**

**West University Historic Preservation Zone, Non-Contributing Resource**

Installation of a new wall sign.

Staff Taku introduced the project and read into the record the recommendation from the WUHZAB meeting of 12-17-19.

Project designer, Jude Cook, from Cook Signs Inc., presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Jenkins, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval as presented.

**HPZ- 19-113, 825 East University**

**West University Historic Preservation Zone, Non-Contributing Resource**

Installation of rebranded signs.

Staff Taku introduced the project and read into the record the recommendation from the WUHZAB meeting of 12-17-19.

Mark Jones from Fluoresco Services presented the project on behalf of the Marshall Foundation.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee concurred with WUHZAB that sign #7 should not be replaced as proposed.

It was moved by Commissioner Mulder, and duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval of the proposed signs (#1 to #6) as presented; and (2) existing sign #7 to be maintained as is or removed.

#### **4. Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases**

*UDC Sections 5.12.7; 2.2.6.C.14*

**RNA/DRB-19-14/HPZ-19-115, 130 E Congress Street**

**Chicago Music Store Building**

**Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District, Downtown IID**

Façade Modifications. The building is Individually Listed in the National Register and adjacent to the Armory Park Historic District. Review for consistency with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards and for compatibility with adjacent historic structures.

*\*At 2:17 PM Commissioner Becherer recused from this case due to an ongoing business relationship with the owner of the property.*

Staff Taku and Kohen provided background reviews on the building and introduced the project. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the Design Review Board meeting on 12-20-19, which found the proposed modifications to be in compliance with the Rio Nuevo Area Design Criteria in UDC 5.12.7.

Architect Bill Mackey from Worker Inc. presented the project and discussed the modifications to the north, east, and south façades of the former Chicago Music Store building.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Jenkins, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 (\*Commissioner Becherer recused and did not vote) to recommend approval as presented, noting that the removed historic titles are to be saved.

#### **5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

*\*At 2:42 P.M. Commissioner Becherer rejoined the meeting.*

##### **a. Minor Reviews**

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park and West University.

##### **b. Appeals**

None at this time.

**c. Zoning Violations**

Staff provided information on ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance.

**d. Review Process Issues/Discussions**

Efforts to change to full online distribution of review materials is in progress (no estimated date for this change is available at this time); recent efforts that required applicants to better research the contributing status of any resource proposed for demolition were lauded, and it was suggested that this be added to the HPZ Design Review Checklist; proposed Armory Park Design Guidelines are being reviewed by Chair Majewski and will be distributed for review by members of PRS after her review.

**6. Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

No one spoke.

**7. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings**

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting is scheduled for 1-23-20.

**8. Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:50 P.M.